

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY**

**SAINT BARNABAS MEDICAL CENTER,**

**Plaintiff,**

**v.**

**NORTHERN NEW JERSEY TEAMSTERS  
BENEFIT PLAN,**

**Defendant.**

03-CV-3187 (WJM)

**LETTER ORDER**

**HON. WILLIAM J. MARTINI**

**THIS MATTER** comes before the Court on Plaintiff Saint Barnabas Hospital's ("St. Barnabas") Second Motion for Reconsideration of Magistrate Judge Hedges's Denial of Remand. In their motion, the Plan asks the Court to reverse two orders by United States Magistrate Judge Ronald J. Hedges (together, the "Orders"). The first order, dated August 22, 2006, denied Saint Barnabas's motion to reopen and remand this matter to State court. The second order, dated September 20, 2006, denied reconsideration of the August 22 order.

Upon reviewing the parties' submissions, the Court holds that Judge Hedges's rulings were in error. Accordingly, the Court will **REVERSE** Judge Hedges's Orders and **REMAND** this matter to the Superior Court of New Jersey, Essex County, Law Division. In reaching this ruling, the Court hereby adopts in full the reasoning of United States District Judge John C. Lifland's opinion in *Newark Beth Israel v. Northern New Jersey Teamsters Benefit Plan*, Civ. Nos. 03-2922, 05-5309, 05-5373, 05-5742, 2006 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 70991 (D.N.J. Sept. 29, 2006). The Court notes that Judge Lifland's opinion is factually identical to the matter presently before the Court and is based upon a correct interpretation of the relevant law, including *Pascack Valley Hosp., Inc. v. Local 464A UFCW Welfare Reimbursement Plan*, 388 F.3d 393 (3d Cir.

2004) and *Cnty. Med. Ctr. v. Local 464 UFCW Welfare Reimbursement Plan*, 143 Fed. Appx. 433 (3d Cir. 2005). Therefore,

**IT IS** on this 20th day of November, 2006, hereby

**ORDERED** that the Plan's Second Motion for Reconsideration of Magistrate Judge Hedges's Denial of Remand is **GRANTED** and, accordingly, Judge Hedges's Orders are hereby **REVERSED**; and

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that this matter is remanded to the Superior Court of New Jersey, Essex County, Law Division.

s/William J. Martini  
**William J. Martini, U.S.D.J.**

cc: The Hon. Ronald J. Hedges, U.S.M.J.